NOTICE:
The copyright law of the United States (Title 17, United States Code) governs the making of reproductions of copyrighted material. One specified condition is that the reproduction is not to be “used for any purpose other than private study, scholarship, or research.” If a user makes a request for, or later uses a reproduction for purposes in excess of “fair use,” that user may be liable for copyright infringement.

RESTRICTIONS:
This student work may be read, quoted from, cited, and reproduced for purposes of research. It may not be published in full except by permission by the author.
Graphic Depictions of Joan of Arc in
Popular Culture: A Historical Approach to
National Identity Through Religious Figures

Heather Palmer

Candidate for the degree
Bachelor of Arts

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for
College Honors
Departmental Distinction in History

Guillaume de Syon, Ph. D.
Thesis Advisor (co-reader)

Robert Seesengood, Ph. D.
Thesis Advisor (co-reader)

Jennifer Koosed, Ph. D.
College Reader
F. Wilbur Gingrich Library
Special Collections Department
Albright College

Release of Senior Thesis

I hereby deliver, give, and transfer property, rights, interest in and legal rights thereto which I had, have, or may have concerning the Senior Honors Thesis described below to the Special Collections Department of the F. Wilbur Gingrich Library at Albright College as an unrestricted gift. While copyright privileges will remain with me, the author, all privileges to reproduce, disseminate, or otherwise preserve the Senior Honors Thesis are given to the Special Collections Department of the Gingrich Library. I place no restrictions on this gift and hereby indicate this by signing below.

Title: Graphic Depictions of Joan of Arc in Popular Culture: A Historical Approach to National Identity Through Religious Figures

Signature of Author: [Signature]
Date: 4/24/15

Printed Name of Author: Heather M. Palmer

Street Address: 1513 Newell Rd.

City, State, Zip Code: Canton, PA 17724
Graphic Depictions of Joan of Arc in
Popular Culture: A Historical Approach to
National Identity Through Religious Figures

Heather Palmer

Candidate for the degree

Bachelor of Arts

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for

College Honors

Departmental Distinction in History

Guillaume de Syon, Ph. D.  
Thesis Advisor (co-reader)

Robert Seesengood, Ph. D.  
Thesis Advisor (co-reader)

Jennifer Koosed, Ph. D.  
College Reader
Abstract

Modern imagery representing Joan of Arc has contributed to perpetuating her memory in specific contexts, thus giving it multiple values that suited different political and social agendas. Among the many representations of Joan in popular culture and modern memory three forms of mass media from the late nineteenth to early twentieth centuries exemplify this process. The first is the printing of postcards representing Joan of Arc and her deeds at the turn of the century. Another form of media used to exploit her iconic power for political gain was Vichy propaganda during World War II. Finally images of Joan in comics from the twenty-first century depict her as an international symbol with an ambiguous gender and political association. By using gender analysis, and memory theory, one can trace how Joan’s image has moved from the political left to the right in France. She has been transformed from a strong-minded heroine into a virginal and pious figure in postcards, then onto a motherly figure in Vichy propaganda in order to match Fascist values. In the modern context, Joan has regained some of her heroine facets in French and foreign graphic novels that have attempted to cast her image in a non-conservative light.
Preface and Acknowledgements

Thanks to my thesis advisors Dr. de Syon and Dr. Seesengood and also my college reader Dr. Koosed for their guidance, revisions, and comments through this process.

An additional thanks to Dr. de Syon for all the translations used in this honors thesis.

I dedicate this thesis to my parents and friends who have loved and supported me through everything. This thesis is also dedicated to my friends. I couldn’t have been nearly as successful as I’ve been without our late night study sessions or our random coffee excursions.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preface/ Acknowledgements</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. History, Biography and Historiography</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Theoretical Approaches</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Postcards</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Vichy France and Propaganda</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Comics</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. Conclusion</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII. Sources and Bibliography</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX. Appendix I: Exkurs on Comics</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X. Appendix II: Illustrations</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I. Introduction

An insignificant event in the medieval Hundred Years' War between France and England spawned the memory of an unlikely heroine: Joan of Arc. A teenaged sheepherder, she showed up at the French king's court claiming that God had summoned her to go and fight the British invaders. Despite royal skepticism that she had heard voices from God as early as 1425, by 1431 she was leading French troops, but she was captured and burned at the stake that same year. Afterwards, memories of her deeds cast her persona into a spiritual part of French identity, one that assumed special characteristics in the twentieth century. Joan of Arc has been manipulated throughout history, both during her lifetime and the years that followed. Since much of Joan’s life is not known, it has been easier for history to manipulate her memory and create a Joan to fit others’ ideals and expectations of her. This manipulation and alteration also applies to imagery and Joan as a symbol. No matter how Joan is used or studied, others will always manipulate her image. In my case it is this thesis that tries to use Joan’s image to illustrate a point, which is still unable to capture her without projecting some type of myself on her. I have tried to explore the ways that she has been used as an advantage for others in a French context, but in doing so there have been outside forces still trying to control that.

Symbols can serve to convey messages and even reinforce political ones depending on context. Joan's many contexts as a symbol put her to use in democratic, dictatorial and even global realms as we shall see. This thesis argues that modern
imagery, representing Joan of Arc, has contributed to perpetuating her memory in contemporary political and social contexts giving it multiple values meaningful to both producers and consumers of her newly minted image in popular culture. Joan’s image is exploited in postcards from the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century, Vichy propaganda from World War II, and graphic novels from the late twentieth and early twenty-first century. Since Joan’s image is a nationalized, gendered identity, my analysis will foreground social memory and gender analysis.

Postcards, propaganda, and comics are forms of cheap mass media. The fact they are inexpensive and accessible make them effective ways to inform the masses, which allows political ideas to be delivered to a multitude of people. Thus, the political French right was able to manipulate the majority of the population through these images of Joan and the easily accessibility of these mediums. Postcards have been associated as being a platform for political propaganda distributed to society’s masses. According to John Fraser, author of “Propaganda on the Picture Postcard,” “the kind of writing and the spelling errors on the picture postcards that survive, it appears that the greatest users of such cards were lower middle-class and working class people.” Therefore, this form of media was produced with a certain audience in mind that was not highly educated. The errors illustrate a lack of production value, which would not have been shown if these postcards were meant for the elite of European society. Additionally, Fraser states “[its] cheapness in cost and postage put it within the means of most working people.” The low cost of these cards also indicates the attended audience and the accessibility of these cards to the majority of the population. Since these cards were cheap it allowed political

2 Ibid.
messages to be presented to an audience that would be more susceptible of accepting what was presented on the postcards.

Comics are a medium that has been produced largely for children and the content within the pages. According to Guillaume de Syon, "In the realm of youth publications, strange bedfellows came to include French communists, who opposed the Americanization of French culture, and Catholics, who feared the presence of ‘adult’ material in the comics." Therefore, in French culture comics have been associated with a form of media geared toward an impressionable youth. This intended audience illustrates comic’s capability of being manipulated and controlled in order to have a particular approved message. In France there was a law that enabled “a surveillance commission that would vet all youth publications, including comic strips.” These limitations in material available for comic stories inhibited the content in French comics, which affected historical themes represented within this type of material. In terms of relaying historical content, French comics, from the 1970s, seem emphasize the morals presented “designed to fit a traditional Christian outlook that permeated postwar Francophone comic strips.” Thus, the law on the restrictions of content in comics and other similar media permeated an exploited vision of history. There was a sense of manipulation of historical figures in order to emphasize a political or moral agenda by the government, which was able to reach a young and allegedly naive audience.

---

4 Ibid.
5 Ibid.
Joan of Arc's characteristics and her story are malleable: they fit political agendas, religious ideals, and even feminine (though rarely feminist) inspirations. As Michel Winock notes in his assessment of Joan of Arc's importance, in the modern era alone she has been a symbol of the rise against the monarchy, an emblem of French independence under Napoleon, a special figure for French Catholics, and a secular defender of rights for Republicans. In World War I, she became an inspirational figure of struggle against German invasion and achieved Sainthood after the war only to be transformed twenty years later into a sign of docile respect for the pro-Nazi Vichy government and its anti-British stance. Presently, a statue of her covered in gold leaf seems to manage traffic jams near the Louvre Museum in Paris, attracting tourists while also serving as the site of demonstrations by the French extreme right wing party, the “Front National.”

I propose an examination of the themes, portrayals, and attributes of the character Joan of Arc in popular, modern memory through three forms of mass media. The first is the printing and publication of postcards representing Joan of Arc and her deeds at the turn of the century. The era 1890-1914 represents the watershed of postcard correspondence, very much an Instagram of that time. All kinds of prints were made, from advertisements, to pictures of train wrecks, to famous personalities. Joan of Arc did not escape this phenomenon, which record her actions in war, as well as, her piety.

Next, I wish to examine the heroine's transformation into a more problematic figure where politicization became more pronounced: Vichy France. As France surrendered to Germany in June 1940, a government of collaboration formed in France around Marshall Philippe Pétain, a World War I hero of the battle of Verdun. The

---

7 Winock 440, 455-457.
ensuing propaganda to prop up his regime appropriated the image of Joan as a great embodiment of values that were not only Christian, but also inherently French. Joan was now a compliant woman respectful of hierarchy and embodying the ideals of a young virgin who would remain pure until death. In emphasizing obedience as much as sacrifice, the regime resurrected the old battle themes of rebellion from England. The image was so tarnished that, while Joan remains an emblematic figure of French identity, she is now associated with the far right in France. Additionally, this facet associated with the visual propaganda of the 1940s.

My third area of investigation is to examine the malleability of Joan of Arc's image in comic books. Beyond French-language comics, the heroine has inspired Manga, English language comics, and graphic novels. Here, I will use the different ways that the genre of comics can be interpreted visually and the theories that undergird the interpretations. My point is to understand the latest evolution of Joan of Arc's image and the use of her image when it leaves the realm of France as well as what implications this migration has on her popular memory. To do so requires first a brief overview of the field of “Joanic Studies,” before considering what tools may be useful to understand the power of her image in the contemporary era.

II. History, Biography, and Historiography

Joan of Arc was born in the Lorraine province of France around 1412 during the Hundred Years’ War between England and France. She gained military power after coming to and addressing the future king Charles VII, recognizing him among a crowd even though she did not know who he was. She was able to help France gain as many as eight victories

---

(records differ) over the British forces, which increased her own popularity. In 1429, Joan had Charles crowned in the cathedral at Rheims, which reestablished French noble authority in France. Joan was eventually captured and held prisoner by the British who then gave her to the French Inquisition. She was eventually tried at Rouen and burned for heresy in 1431.

One problem with the representation of Joan of Arc is that there are not many primary sources that mention her appearance. According to Marina Warner, the author of *Joan of Arc: The Image of Female Heroism*, “The only picture of Joan that survives from her lifetime is a doodle in the margin of the records kept by Clément de Fauquemberghe, clerk to the Parlement of Paris.” In addition, the clerk that had sketched this drawing of Joan is reported never to have seen Joan. Thus, the depictions that were to follow of Joan would be an idealization.

Despite her short life, biographies of Joan of Arc abound. The French national library alone lists over 6,500 printed works published between 1600 and the present, including the famous 1853 biography by Jules Michelet; Michelet, though an ardent Republican, argued that her deeds for the French kingdom made her a national heroine. A peculiarity of so many biographies, as Colette Beaune author of one of the most recent has noted, concerns the sources on Joan; most secondary works already rely on secondary works, and many in fact will not consider sources published in other languages than

---

9 Warner, 4-5.
10 Warner, 14.
11 Ibid.
French. However, Beaune goes beyond pointing out this peculiarity to include an important fact: modern society's obsession with heroics does not match Joan of Arc's era.

In the Middle Ages, one displays neither individualism nor peculiarity; everyone belongs to a group (a family, a village, a brotherhood), everyone relates to a state [condition] of the world that sets its standards which everyone must follow. Joan does not need to be Joan; she is a maiden or a sheep tender, and all view her through such models. The individual does not exist beyond links to others or to God. Finally, and especially, Joan is a daughter of Eve, so clerics expect the worst of her (Eve doomed humanity), but also the best (Mary saved it).

Joan was thus a contradiction in terms and a living myth, giving rise to all kinds of legends. Few have taken these on, and Beaune herself bemoans the fact that there is no equivalent in French to Marina Warner's study.

The book *Joan of Arc: The Image of Female Heroism*, by Marina Warner, is an examination of the historical events surrounding Joan of Arc and also an interpretation of this history, her memory, and myth. Many things have been written about Joan of Arc's effect on culture, but in the early 1980s, Warner's study of Joan of Arc's image became a foundational text that still resonates. The book is an attempt to reestablish Joan of Arc in her historical context and reconstruct her image. Her argument is focused on “[telling] the story of how the story came to be told, to find out why Joan of Arc was believed, how that belief was expressed, what its expression affirmed and what it has served.”

Though republished in 1999 by a university press, Warner's book is a popular history, well received, but also controversial because she does not achieve everything she set out to do. Flawed analysis and incomplete material in Warner’s book makes this work a

---

13 Beaune, 9.
14 Beaune, 11.
15 Beaune, 9.
17 Warner, 10.
pioneering survey, but not a definitive one. To Anne Llewellyn Barstow, author of a review of Warner’s book, there is an issue regarding Joan’s challenge to Church authority, which is the basis of her trial and judgment. According to Barstow, Warner “implies that the fifteenth century was a time favorable to independent religious actions.” This disregards persecution of religious minorities in Medieval Europe, Joan’s trial, and judgment. It also reaffirms Beaune’s statement regarding individualism in the Middle Ages. Barstow also mentions that Warner is unable to make connections that emphasize Joan's role as a nonconformist.

Barstow is not the only one to have concerns about Warner's analysis. Eminent medievalist Caroline Walker Bynum mentions Warner’s inability to complete her own analysis of Joan and the inaccuracies of her findings. Warner’s book intends to look at Joan as a “historical monograph, an anthropological essay, a feminist analysis, a psychological profile of western culture, and a critique of linear thinking.” These approaches are not explored fully, and since Warner is looking at Joan through so many analytical approaches, she seems to lose focus. Furthermore, there are some concepts that Warner inaccurately describes in her book, including Joan’s transvestitism. According to Bynum, the “chronology of [Joan’s] images is never clear,” but are “used in shifting incompatible, and sometimes historically inaccurate senses.”

The examples Warner used to further her argument in regards to transvestites do not match Joan of Arc's era; drawn from different points and history, they weaken Warner’s

---

19 Barstow, 437.
21 Bynum, 208.
argument. During Joan’s lifetime, women cross-dressing as men were not perceived as doing something negative. Overall, female cross-dressers were accepted because they were striving to become more like men, who were perfect. Joan’s case differed from the norms of her social context and it appears that Joan’s cross-dressing could have been looked down upon because she maintained her own gender. Thus, her breaking of gender norms played a major role of her persecution. Warner seems to avoid making a distinction between cross-dressing and its role within Joan’s historical context and ends up simplifying its overall place in the Middle ages. Therefore, based on inconsistent examples taken from Joan’s historical context, Warner’s argument regarding her cross-dressing is invalid. What Warner’s work’s shortcomings indicate is that there is still room for interpretation through such prisms as gender, memory, and visual culture. Indeed, the cross-dressing element, while an issue in the Middle Ages, seemed to become a non-issue in the twentieth century. This intriguing element contributes to the question this thesis seeks. It has been over thirty years since Warner’s book was published, and there are still missing pieces in her argument. This has allowed other historians to contribute to the debate about Joan's meaning. Taking its cue from this state of affairs this thesis contributes by analyzing evidence Warner and others chose not to take into account, namely postcards, pictures and comics.

III. THEORETICAL APPROACHES

22 Ibid.
23 Patricia Turning, Ph. D. “The Other Sexes” (class lecture, Albright College, Reading, PA, November 21, 2014).
24 Ibid.
Combining three separate and primary print sources whose only commonality is twentieth-century mass publishing risks creating an ahistorical study. However, combining theoretical approaches can help solve this issue in the form of memory theory, gender analysis, and visual culture's influence on memory studies. Taken together, these methods help identify and extract the peculiarities of the Joan of Arc symbol and they show how, as the director of the Joan of Arc Center in Orléans has explained, regardless of context, the image of the maiden of Orléans remains extremely malleable.26

 Everyone “knows” of Joan of Arc, but nobody really knows her; this is ascribable to the phenomenon of memory. As Pierre Nora notes “history” and “memory” are very different. History represents an analysis of the past based on evidence. Memory, on the other hand reflects a socio-cultural understanding of the past that may choose to overlook evidence or reinterpret it to suit various agendas.

Memory is life, borne by living societies, founded in its name. It remains in permanent evolution, open to the dialectic of remembering and forgetting, unconscious of its successive deformations, vulnerable to manipulation and appropriation, susceptible to being long dormant and periodically revived. History, on the other hand, is the reconstruction, always problematic and incomplete, of what is no longer. Memory is a perpetually actual phenomenon, a bond tying us to the eternal present; history is a representation of the past. Memory, insofar as it is affective and magical, only accommodates those facts that suit it; it nourishes recollections that may be out of focus or telescopic, global or detached, particular or symbolic - responsive to each avenue of conveyance or phenomenal screen, to every censorship or projection. History, because it is an intellectual and secular production, calls for analysis and criticism. Memory installs remembrance within the sacred; history, always prosaic, releases it again. Memory is absolute, while history can only conceive the relative. At the heart of history is a critical discourse that is antithetical to spontaneous memory. History is perpetually suspicious of memory, and its true mission is to suppress and destroy it.27

---

26 Meeting at JCA, Orléans, January 13, 2015. Interview with Olivier Bouzy, Director of the Center.
However useful memory as a category of analysis is here, in application to Joan, it would be incomplete if one overlooked gender. In the context of the Middle Ages and of France, other methods could come in handy, including the matter of religious relations, but gender, as opposed to race or economics appears the most promising track to help solve the matter. Most historical leaders in French history are men, including in memory. Here, however, Joan of Arc joins the likes of Napoleon and Louis XIV. She is breaking a gender barrier of sorts. How does one deal with the exception?

According to Joan W. Scott, author of “Gender: A Useful Category of Historical Analysis,” “the world of women is part of the world of men, created in and by it.”28 In addition Scott emphasizes that women’s:

sexual objectification is the primary process of the subjection of women. It unites act with word, construction with expression, perception with enforcement, myth with reality. Man fucks woman; subject verb object.29

Thus, this male-dominated hierarchy and the objectification of women presented by Scott reflects what is evident in society and expressed in the images of women. This gender hierarchy is an important way to explain Joan’s image and how it can be taken and manipulated with greater ease to fit a male-centered social and political agenda.

Both memory and gender approaches sometimes combine to form a historical fabric. Thus, Marina Warner in her analysis of the myth of Joan of Arc is struck by the way in which heroes and heroines are often the vessels of our most self-flattering illusions.30 She adds that the ideas such people represent can often be questionable, yet these rarely affect the hero or heroine themselves, for s/he is pure. In the case of Joan, her

---

29 Scott, 1056.
30 Warner, 6.
image in popular memory thus bears no relationship to historical reality. If memory is recasting both the past and gender roles within it, how is that expressed? It is expressed through images.

While an exhaustive survey of Joan of Arc in the modern era would involve a filmography (at least six movies about her have been made and distributed) and some theater plays, the power of the printed image comes across as more meaningful, because it is more accessible. However, visual culture also requires its own theoretical construct. In the case of this thesis, it is this link which may help resolve the parallels between memory and gender.

Graphic novels, comics, and postcards fall into the category of visual culture, which “illustrates” both myth and memory. According to Eilean Hooper-Greenhill, “Visual culture works towards a social theory of visuality, focusing on questions of what is made visible, who sees what, how seeing, knowing and power are interrelated. It examines the act of seeing as a product of the tensions between external images or objects, and internal thought processes.” Therefore, visual culture has the ability to connect images used in graphic novels to religion and myth through its ability to semiotically use external images to reflect internal thoughts.

Graphic novels and comics, like postcards and Vichy propaganda, allow for certain portrayals of historical or religious figures that reflect manipulated beliefs of a mythic past. Secular visual culture mimics religious iconography. According to Darby Orcutt, “religious traditions rely on icons to engage and promote identification of humans

33 Ibid.
Thus, a physical portrayal of a figure becomes a way for an individual to associate with that particular figure’s myth. A person’s identification is a way for people to take elements from the past and manipulate them by finding their own way to relate them to an appropriated context. Visual culture is susceptible to memory. The sparseness of descriptions of Joan’s appearance creates a gap for individuals to appropriate her image to their own expectations; her image and memory can be appropriated to fit a variety of political ideas. Thus the tensions between objects and the ideas behind them; Joan and her image were subject to the manipulation of others resulting in a fight for her by the right and left.

Whereas Joan Scott stresses deconstruction of gender roles and Pierre Nora also uses post-structuralism to expose the process of memory in French history, the problem for assailing Joan of Arc’s role in popular visual culture lies in linking the power of images to memory.

Aside from smell, sight is one of the most powerful triggers of memory. Not only does it remind us of moments in time or specific objects, it may mislead memory. An example of this could be any historical biographical movie in which the events are misremembered, which affects the memory of that particular historical event. This in turn will allow not only for the manipulation of historical fact, but will in turn modify historical and political interpretations of it. It will also become embedded in the culture that choses to reinterpret the falsified event to suit its community needs. This is happens, for example in the film Braveheart (1995) where the main character, William Wallace, had an affair with Edward II’s wife Isabella of France, which produced a child that would

---

later be the next king of England, Edward III. This portrayal of historical events is completely inaccurate due to the time period that each historical character had been active. Isabella came after the events of *Braveheart*, which means that this portrayal could not be accurate. Yet the movie was greeted as a great symbol of Scottish independence and has fed separatist ideals in Scotland for the past fifteen years in a way that no accurate historical account ever could inspire. Thus, the movie *Braveheart* creates an inaccurate visual memory through the portrayal of a fictional romance. Yet it establishes a link to the historical past, no matter how inaccurate it is. The same concept goes for representation of Joan of Arc.

Sophie Baudeuf, a specialist of the image of Joan in the theater, notes how the heroine was enrolled in the fight of the Catholic Church against the Reformation. Her association with the Reformation came because of one fight between factions in Orléans had taken place in 1562 and resulted in damage to her statue (unplanned). The damage was later blamed on Protestants and used by some to unite Catholics around claims that Protestants lacked piety. Yet Protestants did not exist in Medieval Europe. This is ironic; because of course Protestants did not exist in Medieval Europe. Joan was almost a century apart from Martin Luther and his break from the Church. Therefore, the malleability of symbols, including those of heroes overlooks historical fact to create a memory based on irrelevant elements.

---

The cliché "an image is worth a thousand words" does not solve the question of the proper representation of Joan, because simply seeing an image of Joan of Arc will not necessarily trigger a memory reaction or tell us what the originator of the image was arguing. Art history constantly offers visual analysis, but it does not allow us to compare similar actions in different contexts. An image of the Virgin Mary, for example, may reflect the era in which it was painted and the style used, but because it conforms to specific visual cues defined in religious and artistic dogma, we are left with limited means to interpret beyond this superficial point. Since almost all of the images of Joan have been created posthumous any analysis is unable to show the person behind the historical figure.

Scholars have taken on this issue of visual cues in memory. Barbie Zelizer in particular suggests a kind of “snapshot” process affects our visual memory:

[the visual] depicts for its onlookers a moment in an event's unfolding to which they attend while knowing where that unfolding leads. This means that visual work often involves catching the sequencing of events or issues midstream, strategically freezing it at its potentially strongest moment of meaningful representation.37

She ads that images about the past appear in a variety of settings and individuals often know more about an event than what has been depicted visually in certain images. They become spectators of the past, but already know what comes next.38 This also means that, like more traditional forms of memory associated with monuments or writings, individuals exposed to images may choose to relate to the particular depiction in a special way. An image may speak to them, whether it is because of its style, its beauty or its

37 Barbie Zelizer, "The Voice of the Visual in Memory" in *Framing Public Memory* (Kendall R. Phillips, ed.; Tuscaloosa, The University of labam Press, 2004), 158, [http://repository.upenn.edu/asc_papers/58](http://repository.upenn.edu/asc_papers/58) (accessed March 2015)

38 Zelizer, 159.
content. Depictions may also support a text or attract a viewer to reading it and thus convince him or her of the value of that representation. A picture can become something hated, loved, or revered. It is an object, too. So an image can be a cue, a message, or a trigger all at once depending upon context.\textsuperscript{39}

This element of memory as visual cue unites the theoretical elements shown so far, especially as this study involves three seemingly unrelated ways of looking at Joan of Arc: picture postcards, propaganda drawings, and comics. All three are contemporary modes of a “visual rhetoric.”\textsuperscript{40} True, each has its own peculiarities, but when combined, they point to a vivid memory of Joan of Arc that has been expanded in a variety of political and cultural settings. From gender to ideology to religion or simple entertainment, postcards, propaganda pictures and comics give us a glimpse into the afterlife of a heroine five centuries beyond her death.

\textsuperscript{39} Zelizer, 161.
\textsuperscript{40} Zelizer, 180.
IV. POSTCARDS

Joan of Arc was a popular theme in postcards from the “Belle Époque,” 1890-1914. Postcard correspondence itself was extremely popular. These postcards were in such a demand that the Joan of Arc center alone had over 700 different examples of them from the late nineteenth and early twentieth century. These postcards depict her actions in war and her pious life. One of the major influences of this popularity was a rise in popular Catholicism, notably in rural areas, partly in response to the ongoing struggle between the young French Third Republic and traditional monarchist and conservative groups. At a time of secularization, this religious feature of the postcards was a way for popular Catholicism to fight the separation of Church and State in France by appropriating a symbol of the French Republic. Joan of Arc, ironically, would become a symbol of the left and of the right, but it is her religious features that are emphasized in postcards.

As souvenirs of travels and visits to different places, postcards became “relics of a trinketizing touristic countenance” whose “reified image memorializes the exotic other.” Postcards as touristic “relics” blur into the realm of actual pilgrim, religious relics. Most religious relics in medieval Europe were attractions or sites which drew crowds. This is analogous to tourists collecting different postcards along their travels to record where they had been. In a sense, postcards were a piece of a location or event which a tourist could carry away. Therefore, postcards, even if regarded as tourist objects, have a quasi-religious component.

---

Postcards as quasi-religious relic are particularly important for Joan of Arc postcards. Her spiritual associations are illustrated through reprinted episodes of her life recorded in art, images of her public celebrations, and pictures of her various statues. Postcards do not simply communicate news; they can serve as cheap religious icons. According to Orcutt, “In similar ways to comics, religious traditions rely on icons to engage and promote identification of humans with them.” Icons illustrate religious myth and doctrine; Orcutt notes illiterate medieval Christians often learned scripture via stained glass windows. These visual representations of Joan are an alternative way for individuals to read the story of Joan as well as identify with the spiritual and saintly figure. The identification with Joan is more accessible than other high culture formats, such as literature or museum paintings.

Joan of Arc's beatification, filed for in the 1860s, occurred in 1909. Beatification is a level one reaches before sainthood. The event inspired many depictions of Joan and influenced the image of her on popular postcards. There is a Joan of Arc postcard from that exact year that contains a picture of a feast dedicated to her. This postcard illustrates an elevation of Joan to the status of Christ. It appears that the postcards from the time of Joan’s beatification focus on a saintly depiction of her. The feast portrayed in this postcard appears to be in a church with stained glass windows and altar and which has what looks like a shrine dedicated to Joan. A statue of Joan is placed at the top of the church’s alter where a figure of Christ would normally be (plate 1.) Therefore, the depictions of Joan as a divine figure or a pious person in these postcards could be a belief

42 Orcutt, 95.
43 Orcutt, 96.
in her inevitable sainthood by the French populace. Other images that emphasize this theme include the postcard “Apothéose de Jeanne d’Arc” (plate 2). This particular postcard was also produced in 1909, and the image of Joan is surrounded by figures of angels on clouds with a heavenly light descending on Joan and a circle of laurel around her head. Another example is the postcard “L’Apothéose de la Bienheureuse Jeanne,” (plate 3) postcard also shows a divine Joan surrounded by winged figures with a halo around her head.

There is a series postcards of Joan from the same time period that appears to be photographs of a series of actors and actresses dressed as the historical figures of Joan’s life. This series illustrates the overarching theme that Joan’s image transitions from identifiably feminine before and after her call to service as the savior of her country; while depicted as a soldier she is mostly depicted either as androgynous or less feminine. In the postcard that depicts Joan leaving her home and father she is wearing a dress appropriate of a woman of her status, but in the postcard that is of her judgment and during battle she appears to be dressed as a man (plates 4 and 5). The final postcard of this series has Joan with long hair and in a white dress at her execution. Here she mirrors Jesus during his crucifixion through a handwritten sign placed above her head, garments of white linen, and the political officials surrounding the execution. Similar to the only sketch of Joan during her lifetime, these postcards also bear the initials “JHS.” This is a “medieval monogram for the Holy Name of Jesus,” which is often depicted on a sign above her head at her execution.45 The ropes binding Joan in this postcard depicting her execution drape around her to emphasize her feminine shape, but the image never crosses

the line of sexual exploitation (plate 6.) However, as further evidence of Joan Scott’s point, the objectification of Joan to suit a male viewership is present.

Some of the images of Joan in early twentieth century postcards reflect female fashion of the time when the postcards were produced. Joan is depicted almost like a movie star in certain poses and the appearance of their hair. Joan is either given long hair or a shorter hairstyle, which is fashioned in a 1920’s bob instead of a style of the fifteenth century. This emphasized femininity of Joan’s appearance is shown in the gold ink postcard “Jeanne d’Arc” (plate 7). Therefore, the images of Joan being portrayed in these postcards were an impression of the time of publication the expectations of femininity of the period. Additionally, the perception of Joan as a saint restricts the explicit depiction of a sexual Joan, but there is still evidence of her womanly image. As Pierre Nora explains, memory that is almost disappearing can be reborn because it serves a need. Just as one chooses to remember the Kennedy assassination rather than that of President McKinley, so too do people choose to remember aspects of Joan of Arc’s life. Thus, memory is reborn, but in so doing it recasts not so much gender roles, but the image of gender. Joan is a simple maiden from the countryside, but she can display physical grace, in the manner of portrayals of the Virgin Mary. To suggest anything beyond her saintly attributes would be considered blasphemy to Catholics welcoming the news of her beatification and later of her sainthood.

The lack of clear sexualization in the depictions of Joan is also seen through other postcards from the early 1900s in France, such as “Les Fresques du Panthéon” (plate 8). This particular postcard shows Joan embracing the cross, emphasizing an intimate relationship she has with Christianity and Christ. Other images very similar to this
postcard include “Jean d’Arc Brûlée à Rouen” (a black-and-white reprint of the color illustration on plate 8) and “Sainte Jeanne d’Arc sur le Bûcher,” (plate 9). The latter depicts Joan in a dress with a halo and embracing a crucifix, which dates it to her elevation to saint in 1920 (see below.) All the cards considered thus far emphasize her faith and her sacrifice, and to a lesser degree her gender.

The deemphasis of gender in postcards may in some instances reflect a discomfort at discussing Joan's sex. Since Joan was known to be virginal, her relationship with Christ could replace society’s need for sexualizing the maiden. Since the traditional mores of French society viewed women as child bearers for the Republic it would have been logical to think of Joan as a future mother and to thus think of her sexual potential.46 Yet that could be viewed as blasphemous. While the postcards showing her closeness to Christ as she embraces the cross could on the other hand suggest a parallel with Mary Magdalene’s ecstasy, but because this postcard is the realm of popular culture rather than a high culture more familiar with the famous Caravagio painting, it is a remote suggestion at best.

Still, suggestions of parallel lives, that is functions beyond what is traditionally ascribed to Joan of Arc do exist. In one instance, Joan’s image is modeled after the biblical Judith (plate 10.) There is a connection between this particular image of Joan and that of Marianne, the female symbol of the French Republic made famous in the 1830 painting of a woman representing liberty and reason. Both female symbols were alternately dominant in the French Third Republic, with Marianne becoming fully

---

dominant in the Fourth and Fifth Republics, from 1944 onward. According to Baudeuf, Fronton du Duc is aware of Joanic history and compares her to biblical figures for his “religious memory” purposes. Therefore, Judith, Deborah, and Suzanne all serve as a basis to recast Joan as a religious figure:

The use of symbolic attributes of these figures [Judith, Deborah and Suzanne] with form the basis of the maiden's classical iconography and allow to legitimate her fight [standard of Deborah, sword of Judith....) announcing the arrival of an armed virgin, carrying a standard. Joan herself had presented herself as the virgin of prophecies and was announced [introduced] as such by Charles VII's Chancellery.

The models used to form a basis image of Joan illustrate a comparison to biblical women in order to establish her connection to the Church. The association with the Church and these religious depictions will eventually lead to later images of her, such as early postcards, which will emphasize this connection to biblical imagery in order to connect her to the French right.

French identity has been defined through the ages via women, which occurs in all sides of the political spectrum. For example, her image has been used in French politics to show certain political agendas as propaganda in conflicts between the Church, the republic, and varying political parties. Yann Rigolet, the author of “Marianne et Jeanne d’Arc: soeurs ou rivales? Une affaire de femmes en politique,” argues that the birth of “Marianne” as a symbol in 1792 was an allegory of the French first Republic, under attack by anti-revolutionary forces. In parallel, the myth of Joan of Arc was already in place. In some ways, he says, this establishes the iconic opposition between the French political parties and what is thought of as the “two Frances.” One is conservative

48 Baudeuf, 83.
reactionary and even antisemitic. The other is radical, revolutionary, reforming. Joan eventually will become, under the control of Charles Maurras's extreme nationalism, a kind of “Aryan maiden.”

In addition, Joan actually helped form the image of Marianne, a mythical symbol still in use (a bust is in every city hall in France and on French official documents). Around 1792, several revolutionary pamphlets depict Joan as a valiant revolutionary partisan. Some pictures show her assaulting the Orléans Augustin fort in 1429, a parallel to the Parisian assault of the Bastille fortress in 1789. This manipulation of historical and biblical figures is an example of playing on memory in order to seek moral justification in historical fact, which is constructed through extracting historical fact out of its context in order to match current events.

Additionally, Rigolet states that this call on Joan of Arc makes sense because of role of women in French revolution. Many women spontaneously took up the cause, not necessarily to fight militarily in the frontlines but to protect their family and provide for their children. He also mentions that because the French Revolution is the birth of the French nation-state, Joan of Arc becomes more than a maiden. She is now a motherly figure to the birth of France. Therefore, even her association with the Church at a time of secularism in France indicates her cultural attributes that work for this period in French history.

Rigolet also indicates that after WWII, images of Marianne and Joan of Arc are both used partly under the influence of General De Gaulle. However, Joan is tainted

---

50 Rigolet, 65.
51 Rigolet, 66.
through her association with the right and will remain so hereafter. She is in textbooks but nowhere else except on the extreme right and in Catholic conservative circles. Joan has Republican origins, but she is also part of the conservative right, where her image was modified to fit an anti-foreign agenda. On the other hand Marianne is clearly secular and less politicized. Therefore, both female images have been changed, but Joan is the image that has moved to right and connected to radical political movements. She is connected to the right because of manipulated image. They used her connection to French identity to push their own political agendas, but since she was a warrior fighting for French nationalism the Vichy regime took her gender and exploited their own personal values onto the image of Joan.

Many of Joan’s postcards reflect the stages of her life from her visions to her execution in a single card (plate 11.) These postcards usually depict either three or four stages that are similar to the stages of Christ’s life. However, the number of stages in Joan’s postcard series and those seen in the phases of Christ’s life do not match. Still, the parallel is noticeable at several points. Whether it involves her calling, her praying, her sitting in confinement, and of course her execution where she raises her eyes in the manner of Christ raising his when wondering whether God has forsaken him, Joan in effect fulfills another example of martyrdom. The portrayals of her martyrdom matches visions of popular Catholicism in a French state that had challenged the religious establishment for over a century: the element of suffering for a cause, regardless of context, offered an added appeal to those who saw such cards. Therefore, the depictions

---

52 Rigolet, 68.
of her martyrdom this further illustrates the connection between Joan and Christ and how her images emphasize this similarity. One of the postcards that portray the different stages of Joan’s life includes “Jeanne Entend les Voix” (plate 12). This image mimics Jesus’ “stages of the cross” and emphasizes the connection between Jesus and Joan.

There is a theme in the postcards of Joan that emphasizes her piety and holiness which was influenced by the beatification of Joan. Saintly imagery of Joan focuses on her visions of angels before she became a soldier and also upon her chastity. The series of postcards made out of metal carvings illustrate the theme of a docile Joan. She is depicted as never having her sword drawn, which blatantly ignores her role as a soldier during the Hundred Year War. In addition, her image in some postcards emphasizes her androgyny as a soldier, but when her execution is depicted her attributes become. Thus, there was a discrepancy of her being both a woman and a soldier, which was illustrated by her image in battle and afterwards.

There is a noteworthy postcard of Joan printed after her sainthood was recognized where she is shown watching over a French soldier in the trenches of World War I (plate 13.) This image of Joan includes her sword in its hilt, which reaffirms the portrayal of her as a compliant woman. Since she is depicted with her armor, hair, and face being without any sign her femininity, her female presence on the battlefield can be interpreted as being a discomfort to French standards of women’s roles in society. Additionally, some of the postcard images of Joan, such as “J.E. Lenepveu” (plate 14), depict her in battle but have her raising a flag instead of a sword, which could be to illustrate how her presence or spirit was what affected France’s victory. Thus, her image could then be used in later French history to stir up courage and hope for a military victory.
There are postcards of Joan with a raised sword, but the position of the sword does not suggest aggression, for it crosses the flag post. This position creates a sort of cross that alludes to her faith and her relation to Christianity. An image of Joan sleeping has her sword crossed over her legs, which is an instance where it illustrates her chastity and relationship with God. The potential for a sexual relationship is thus shuttered and replaced with Joan's close relationship with the Divine and her commitment to her religion and her mission.

The memory of Joan of Arc is not limited to commemorating her persona and deeds alone. Her impact on Catholic and popular culture was such in the Belle Époque that a special festival was traditionally held in early May every year, involving historical plays and parades in costumes. The latter practice, also commemorated in postcards, actually brings up the matter of gender in an uncommon way.

A selection of the postcard collection from the “Centre Jeanne d’Arc” focuses on the official celebration of the feast of Joan of Arc. In this collection, the women who dress up as Joan appear to be unfeminine. Traditionally, young virgin boys were the participants in this ceremony for Joan of Arc from 1525 to 1912. This tradition illustrates an example of how Joan’s gender role affects her portrayal during celebrations of her involvement in French military victory. Since she was a woman and young boys played her, this exemplifies unsettledness in French society about Joan’s gender and her military exploits. In effect, to avoid empowering women, popular culture perpetuated her example as an exception and did so by having boys instead of girls take on her role.

---

Joan of Arc's impact on popular culture already extended beyond France in the nineteenth century a further evidence of the malleability and appeal of her story. Several of the cards I looked at included some in foreign languages. The postcard “Die Jüngfrau von Orleans” (plate 15) is a German one, though it displays an image of Joan resembling that in French postcards of the same time period: Both the pose of the sword at her side and her form fitting attire are similar as well. Contrastingly, there is also an Italian postcard “Giovanna d’Arco” (plate 16) that shows another way that her image was used internationally in the early 1900s. This postcard is stylistically different from the French postcards because the Italian image shows Joan appears to be in battle with her sword drawn, a contrast with that of most French depictions where she is never seen with her sword raised. In all the French postcards she either has her sword in its sheath or in a non-threatening position.

This added visual cue that the postcard offered during the Belle Époque was also affirmed in the First World War, and even in the 1920s, after the golden era of postcards ended. By then, Joan of Arc, though still a symbol of the Republic, was heavily ensconced in conservative politics due to her sainthood, but also the tumultuous decades that would lead to World War II.

Joan of Arc obtained sainthood in 1920. The event further shifted depictions of her imagery in favor the conservative right, a process that started during her beatification years. In the French context, it is important to recall that since the French Revolution, Catholicism had been a conservative element in French politics, and the separation of Church and state, achieved in 1905, represented a full victory for secularism. To resist,
Catholics adopted tropes such as Joan of Arc's piety to try and fight what they viewed as a shift in national identity. Religion thus remained part of a political agenda.

Following the First World War, the political spectrum evolved considerably. Communism, initially an intellectual utopia, now seemed to become reality with the advent of the Soviet Union in 1917, and the many labor strikes that shook Western democracies right after the Great War. Communism scared the establishment, but so did Fascism, which appeared on the extreme right end of the European political spectrum. France was affected by it, too. Fascism was essentially opposed to a multitude of institutions, including the Church, women, conservatism, and any form of organized establishment. Fascism was attractive to many because it suggested order could be reestablished in the face of warfare, socio-economic trouble, and was seen by many as the “protector” against Communist victory. Fascist ideology tended to attract combat veterans, but also people frustrated with society, primarily men feeling threatened by new developments like feminism. Additionally, Fascism was strongly populist and relied on centralized leadership to build appeal. Generally, Fascism would play a limited role in France in the 1930s because of the failure of right-wing movements to unite. Once France was defeated in 1940, it would unite around the figure of Marshall Philippe Pétain, a World War I hero. In what would become known as the Vichy regime, Joan of Arc became an iconic figure, but whose features and functions were different from the malleability we see in the Belle Époque postcards.

---

V. VICHY FRANCE AND PROPAGANDA

Once she achieved Sainthood in 1920, and all the way to the fall of France in 1940, Joan of Arc's image shifted from the left to right, showing how the representation of myth could serve the purposes of memory as defined ideologically. Once the shift happened, it failed to revert even though Joan of Arc's story remained in itself an inspiring tail. Scholars have examined this process.

Nadia Margolis' essay “The ‘Joan Phenomenon’ and the French Right,” explores the image of Joan of Arc and how she was manipulated to assist the political ideals of the French right, culminating in World War II. Margolis notes that Joan has been used as a French symbol throughout modern French history, with her image fashioned by “trusted authorities skilled at hiding their biases.”

Margolis argues that the individuals who controlled the manipulation of Joan’s image “contributed to the re-birth of a right-wing Joan.” The reason that the French Right used Joan was in order to form a united national identity that had been absent from France.

Inspired by Fascist ideals, the Vichy regime sought “to restore national identity and pride,” which was done through Joan of Arc. Vichy France used Joan in part because Vichy leader Marshall Philippe Pétain considered her a true heroine of "national unity." Said national unity, however, was an exclusionary one in which Joan of Arc as a symbol would serve “as the primary positive element promoting the essence of what Maurras and others would term ‘integral nationalism’: an isolationist, racist, repressive form of

---

56 Margolis, 265-266.
57 Margolis, 266.
patriotism.” 59 Additionally, Margolis mentions that “her image and its interpretation turned normally cloistered scholars into crusaders, of various political backgrounds, in the militantly nationalist endeavor to reestablish French identity.” 60 Therefore, in order to establish a sense of unified national identity the French right corrupted the image to fit with their ideals. Her womanly attributes were exploited by the Vichy regime in order to exemplify total submission to the government. 61

An interesting aspect of Margolis’s essay is three images she uses to show the development of Joan’s image by the Right. She uses image of Joan used by the Third Republic, Octave Guillonet’s illustration Jean d’Arc, and Vichy’s Joan’s ‘Jesus Mary’. According to Margolis, these images were not intended to empower women, but instead reinstitute an idea that “advocated woman’s work only for the state, took care not to intersect deeply with the feminist one, promising women work for their individual well-being.” 62

One of the strengths in Margolis’ essay is her insight on Joan’s association with the French Right and Margolis’ excellent survey of her transition to the political right and how Joan was used to help further Vichy ideals. Margolis breaks down Joan’s life and how at each stage both left and right political parties have used her image. She covers how both political parties used the stages of Joan’s life, which is why she was able to survive the French Revolution and her association with monarchists. 63 This also explains why Joan of Arc became an ideal visual tool of the Vichy regime.

59 Margolis, 269.
60 Margolis, 270.
61 Margolis, 280.
62 Margolis, 275-276.
63 Margolis, 270.
The fall of France in June 1940 and its partial reorganization as the Vichy regime created an odd cultural situation. This was a state that openly collaborated with the Nazis and even instituted its own Fascist measures (such as anti-Jewish legislation), yet it also sought to incorporate the cultural attributes of the Republican France it had just discarded. Joan of Arc and her story fit Fascist needs for three main reasons: her image as a shepherder, her fame as a religious soldier for France, and her public execution. These elements of her life were exaggerated for political effect by the right. Thus, even though she was not just a simple shepherder, this myth of her childhood could be exaggerated and the gender roles connected to her being a shepherder were evoked. These images are brought to the viewers conscious through the emphasis of Joan’s domestic qualities. The same goes for the other elements. In Vichy society, Joan became a servant of the state, and her death supported that commitment.

As Michel Winock has noted, what had been for almost one-hundred and fifty years a symbol of the left had shifted slowly and now became a full symbol of the right.64 Extreme nationalism in the form of Vichy France turned Joan into a myth of the extreme right. Visually, the reincarnation of Joan of Arc into such a symbol suggested a reworking of the sainted girl into an image that fit the visions of femininity in a Fascist state. In effect, all girls, like Joan, should be dutiful, kind, and hard working, but for the single purpose of becoming mothers, not military leaders.

A pictorial record that shows this well involves the visual propaganda of Vichy France. While it emphasized Marshall Pétain as the "savior of France" Fascist propaganda art made use of other national myths and icons, including Joan of Arc's image. Dennis Sexsmith, author of “The Radicalization of Joan of Arc Before and After

64 Winock, 468-469.
the French Revolution” points out, the use of Joan’s image by politicians and activists to illustrate their own ideologies. He claims that “Political activists on the far right, such as Paul Déroulède and Maurice Barrès, adopted her as the model of the France they demanded: Christian, militarist, racially ‘pure,’ and ironically given Joan’s exploits, socially traditional in terms of the roles of women.” 65 Vichy propaganda emphasizes the matronly and motherly qualities that were expected of women in a Fascist political society. This leaves out any room for previous depictions of Joan as androgynous. Instead, Scott’s theory of gender applies once again concerning sexual objectification and the “Man fucks Woman” part of her argument. Therefore, Joan of Arc being androgynous or varying from a patriarchal society’s view of women does not sit well with their expectations. The patriarchal society was unsure how to deal with Joan’s ambiguous gender at times and her lack of sexuality. Therefore, to make sense of that and also use her as a political symbol in time of war Vichy took her image and altered it to fit their own needs.

Vichy used propaganda like school textbooks to further their Fascist ideologies among the French youth. According to Eric Jennings, “the image of Jeanne d’Arc [has] long been exploited to evoke sentiments and defend causes as diverse as patriotism, anticlericalism, mysticism, gallicanism, anglophobia, antisemitism, imperialism and anti-feminism.” 66 Jennings’s argument points out that Joan’s image had been politically and socially exploited before Vichy used her as a fascist symbol, so it is not surprising for her

---

to be used in similar ways by the Fascists. Vichy instituted an image of Joan that affirmed
the regime's sexism, Anglophobia, and Catholicism.67

Joan’s image was used to emphasize the Catholic presence in French society
during the Vichy regime. Jennings states “Joan . . . of course presented an outstanding
model of Christian suffering and sacrifice: she had faced adversity, privations, injury,
betrayal, persecution, imprisonment, the threat of torture, a jump out of a tower window
and, finally, the stake.”68 Her image was used as a symbol of the Church. This image of
her “stood as a female and nationalistic Christ figure, who had gladly paid for the sins of
others.”69 Joan was depicted using religious symbol as a martyr that rescued her country.
This idea of her as a Christ-figure builds on the postcard imagery had her execution
mirror that of Christ’s death.

Regarding the issues of Joan’s gender, Vichy propaganda was able to reconcile
the contradictions of Joan’s role as a soldier with the gender role expectations of Vichy
society. They did this by domesticating Joan and taming her military exploits. According
to Jennings, “Joan’s combativeness derived from her will to defend her simple ‘feminine’
world -- the ‘comfort of home.’”70 In order to keep Joan feminine, Vichy propaganda
depicted her as the typical French girl that enjoyed beautiful and ornamented belongings
such as clothes and armor. Even though she was a soldier there was an emphasis on her
liking of feminine things such as pretty clothes and her sewing ability.71 Joan was often
represented unarmed and passive, much as was done in earlier French postcards that
showed her before she became a warrior. The gender structure set up in the beginning

67 Ibid.
68 Jennings, 718.
69 Jenning, 718.
70 Jennings, 720.
71 Jenning, 721.
half of the twentieth century felt uncomfortable with women heroines illustrated as warriors active in war.

In addition, Vichy wished to get rid of the element of Joan being an androgynous figure. This elimination was achieved by images exaggerating Joan’s feminine attire as a young girl and whenever she was shown engaged in “masculine” activities such as being at war and in her death. In each of these instances dresses or skirts clothed her.72 Consequently, this physical appearance connects the Vichy values that promoted femininity and maternity that were associated with feminine passivity. Joan was depicted as “almost a surrogate mother -- a type of Virgin Mary to whom children flocked: ‘At [her home town of] Domremy, Jeanne loved to be surrounded by children.”73 Thus, her connection to children was a way to solve the tension between Joan’s militant virginity and chastity and the Fascists values of motherhood. She was also depicted as the perfect housewife instead of the warrior she was. According to René Jeanneret, author of a propaganda piece on Joan (see below), “(...)the soldiers like her because she cares for them, primarily by cooking… Her [mother] would be so proud of her tending to household chores while on military campaign.”74 Thus, the exploitation of Joan’s image furthered Vichy’s ideals but also took Joan out of her historical context by drastically changing the previously popular memory surrounding her.

Another piece of Vichy propaganda is René Jeanneret's Le miracle de Jeanne. This textbook's subtitle makes clear that it is a work intended for the “moral upbringing of young Frenchmen.” The textbook falls within the directives of the Vichy regime's educational reforms initiated in November 1940. Therefore, Jeanneret’s statement shows

72 Ibid.
73 quoted in translation in Jennings, 722.
74 quoted in translation in Jennings, 725.
French history's great achievements as dating far beyond 1789, and to minimize in effect the impact of the French Revolution. While Joan’s image stresses a slow evolution, something historians easily follow, it chooses in fact to dismiss major shifts in order to diminish the importance of Republican France in reforming and modernizing the nation.

A picture of her praying as a young girl has the comment "Jeannette travaille sage et pieuse au milieu des siens" ["little Jean, wise and pious, works amongst her family"] (plate 17.)75 This image exemplifies her femininity, the emphasis on family, and the religious aspect of her life. These elements reflect the fascist ideology of the Vichy regime presented in schoolbooks and other propaganda.

A Vichy propaganda booklet for general distribution similarly emphasizes Joan's piety (plate 18.)76 Even though she is pictured as a knight on the cover, she holds the sword as a beloved crucifix, not as an instrument of revenge or justice. The text within also offers attributes of the dutiful young woman: she is “disinterested, expresses her "faith" in France, in the King, in the mission, and of course in God.”77 The example she sets, no matter what she does, is one of stoicism in difficult moments. In other terms, the heroine who gave hope that one could fight the British in the 1420s was now just an example of courage within defeat. This did not stop the propaganda services from using her. Thus, Joan’s power as an image of combativeness and bravery had been reduced by Vichy and subordinated to that of a docile religious figure.

75 AJC, René Jeanneret, *Le miracle de Jeanne. Histoire de Jeanne d'Arc pour servir de livre de lecture et de formation morale aux petits français* (Tours, Maison Mame, 1942.)

76 IHTP, ARC 074-17, "Jeanne d’Arc, sa mission, son exemple," Édition du Secrétariat général de l’Information, undated (ca. 1942-43.)

77 IHTP, ARC 074-17, "Jeanne d’Arc, sa mission, son exemple." n.p.
Since the image and the story of Joan were so well known, it became easy to refer to elements of the narrative as visual cues themselves. Thus, the claim that God had told Joan to "displace the English," a common theme in textbooks and in postcards of the Belle Époque, became a useful trope to Marshall Pétain's propaganda services when handing out small leaflets. The Fascist shifted the motto to getting "the English out of Europe" rather than out of France (plate 19a and 19b.) The real invader, Germany, was of course not to be kicked out, since Vichy collaborated with the Nazis. Therein lies the failure of the Joan of Arc trope for Vichy because she lost her significance as a true resister. The elements that made Joan herself were lost when translated into a Vichy symbol.

Vichy’s propaganda imagery represents the complete rearranging of Joan’s myth, life, and image to suit a political agenda. She is made motherly in context of the social elements of a time to which she does not belong in order to further an ideology. In addition, Vichy’s depiction of Joan represents a blatant disregard for a woman’s accomplishments and role in battle. She is not seen as a soldier, and her power is essentially taken away because there was not room in Fascist ideology for that element of her life.

The end of the Vichy regime represented also the end of Joan's use as a fully French symbol as will be seen further. In its place, Marianne will come in while the maiden of Orléans will be displaced to remaining a symbol of the nationalist right in France, and to popular culture worldwide.

---

78 IHTP, ARC 074-12, leaflet « 13 mai 1944, la France entière fête Jeanne d’Arc héroïne nationale. Pour que la France vive il faut comme Jeanne d’Arc bouter les Anglais hors d’Europe » [May 13, 1944: All of France celebrates Joan of Arc, national Heroine. So that France may live, one should, like Joan of Arc, expelle the British from Europe."
Joan’s image has become a universal symbol beyond French official culture because of her flexibility, which explains why her symbol is still alive. Her ability to conform to the needs of different ideals because of her own history being shrouded in mystery is why she can be used in other contexts. Joan’s malleability is the reason she has appeared in early twentieth century postcards, in Vichy school material, and as we shall see next, in comics. Sexsmith also argues that Joan has an additional quality that has made her such a prominent figure in modern popular culture. According to him, “She combined the best qualities of both sexes to fight for what she believed in, inspired others to join her, and won a permanent place in the Western imagination.”79 This observation is emphasizes the ambiguousness that follows Joan and her gender is an intriguing element that still captivates society.

INTERLUDE: TAKING JOAN OUT OF FRANCE

Joan is in many ways one of the most famous female icons of mass, popular culture in France and internationally. Independently of the shift of Joan of Arc’s image to the extreme right in France, questions were raised in the early 2000s about her role as a gender symbol in memory. Whereas some French politicians felt that her example was no longer current,80 French historian Jacques Le Goff suggested that she should be considered part of a European-wide heritage, and thus a special heroine with transnational values.81 While such a wish may be a chimera in official memory, it has acquired its own power in the alternative reality of comics. Joan’s image is not only malleable in a French political context, but can be easily formed by other countries to

79 Sexsmith, 129.
80 Rigolet, 69.
81 Jacques Legoff, "Jeanne d'Arc, une héroïne européenne!" L'histoire 317 (Feb 2007); 74.
portray their political agenda. Joan of Arc’s life has become an international and national theme in literature and art. Her malleability has been extremely attractive for those looking for an icon to use. Since historians could not fully reconstruct Joan’s life, the gaps are filled with myth and mystery there is room for political groups to use her to their advantage. The international appeal of Joan was seen earlier in her use appearance in German and Italian postcards as well as British plays. According to German historian Gerd Krumeich argues the same idea that Joan is not just a symbol of France. He finds examples where Joan was used in German theatre during the 1800s and then again by the Allies during World War I. According to Krumeich, “[…] the problem of tradition and memory […] resides in the questionable practice of signing up the maiden for any cause, since political patriotism is always ambiguous.”

Thus it comes as little surprise that the Joanian trope has inspired both manga and graphic novels.

Thus, visual culture actually contributes to her “resurrection” through a popular cultural medium with a readership that is no longer simply francophone or European, but worldwide.

The Disney movie Frozen, for example, shows the character Ana cheer on a picture of the struggling female warrior: "hang in there Joan!" The resemblance to the French icon ends there, however, as the cartooned girl utters these words to find the courage to live separated from her isolated sister. New values are thus grafted to old ones, which are not affected by attempts to separate the memory of Joan of Arc's image from historical reality. The fact that Joan is still used in popular culture illustrates her importance as an image and her malleability to particular agendas. What happens in this

---

Disney movie is an echo of what has happened in the realm of printed popular culture, notably postcards, posters and comics.

Thus, Belle Époque postcards and Vichy France visual propaganda prove the malleability in any historical character, especially one that is adopted into popular culture through memory. What is important to understand, however, is that the evolution, while seemingly stuck on the right in France continues in the present in the realm of popular culture in comics.

VI. COMICS

The legitimacy of comics, comic books, and graphic novels as a medium and an art form has been greatly debated. The academic study of comics is relatively recent, yet it offers a multitude of ways to analyze these texts by observing the comics’ visual elements, content, myth, language, composition, ideology, and content.

It is difficult to put comics into a single category when attempting to define the medium. There are many elements that construct comics and related forms, which complicates a simple definition. In *The Power of Comics: History, Form and Culture*, Randy Duncan and Matthew J. Smith define comics in three categories: comics, comic books, and graphic novels. According to Duncan and Smith, the term comics is a general term that covers “the juxtaposing images in sequence.”83 This specific term is considered an umbrella term, which covers “comic strips, comic books, cave paintings, Grecian urns,

---

tapestries, stained glass windows, and more.”\textsuperscript{84} These subcategories are collected under the term comics because they all have a similarity in form. They present a story through the use of panels, which are areas that hold moments of a narrative.

In addition, in the second category comic books are “as an art form, . . . ] a volume in which all aspects of the narrative are represented by pictorial and linguistic images encapsulated in a sequence of juxtaposed panels and pages.”\textsuperscript{85} Comic books are usually brief volumes of a few pages, but there can be series with a large edition made up of many small volumes. The term “comic book” does not mean that all issues of this type are considered comical or funny. The name derives from the comic strips that comic books originated from, but the development of this medium gave way to darker narratives. For example, there are series that focus on a darker subject matter like \textit{Maus} by Art Spiegelman, which is a retelling of his father’s experiences during the Holocaust.\textsuperscript{86}

The category of graphic novels is the third classification of comics discussed by Duncan and Smith. “Graphic novels” describes larger works that usually have a self-contained story. This term also allows the book and the author “to distance themselves from the commercial and periodical connotation associated with comic books,” although graphic novels are also comic books in the basic definition.\textsuperscript{87}

There exist further evolutions and uses of comics (see appendix A, an exkurs on comic history), but how may one analyze these? There are textual methods of analysis that are used to explore the content of comics. Two of these are called “content” and

\begin{footnotes}
\item[84] Ibid.
\item[85] Duncan and Smith, 4.
\item[86] Ibid.
\item[87] Ibid.
\end{footnotes}
“mythic” analysis. Content analysis is a way to study comics that “involves examining the frequency of selected variables presented in media messages.”88 This analysis is considered a quantitative methodology concerned with the numerical amount of concepts. A researcher using this form of analysis focuses on the trends that occur in this media as a whole. Examples of this form of analysis would be looking at the amount of violence or the representation of minorities in certain comics.89

Mythic analysis focuses on a qualitative approach to looking at comics in an analytical way. Instead of looking at statistics of comics, the researcher using the mythic approach looks at the meaning behind the text. Mythic analysis is “designed to look at meanings as interpreted by the audiences, and others explore the meanings constructed by symbols within the text.”90 The researchers that use this form of analysis “review the text to identify how key symbols presented in the text are addressing additional culture concerns.”91 Since myth is used by cultures to illustrate their traditions and values “the researcher’s goal in mythic criticism is to help others see just how such contemporary myths underscore deeper messages.”92

There are many different ways to look at comics in an analytical way, which includes examination of ideology, language, and religion. One of the ways to look at comics analytically is to examine the ideology present in the text’s narrative. According to Duncan and Smith, “Ideology refers to a set of sense-making ideas about how the world works.”93 Furthermore, “Ideologies emerge as groups of people develop ways of

88 Duncan and Smith, 282.
89 Ibid.
90 Duncan and Smith, 283.
91 Duncan and Smith, 284.
92 Ibid.
93 Duncan and Smith, 247.
thinking about relationships between themselves and others in the world.”94 Comics illustrate specific popular and mass ideologies because comic books are a mass produced medium. The creators of these works represent their own ideologies within their creations, and thus their perception of gender and race.

Gender analysis of comics looks specifically at the representation of women in this medium. According to Duncan and Smith, since “depictions in comics are abstracted from reality to one degree of another, the selection of traits that a character embodies—both in terms of personality and physical appearance—runs the risk of relying on stereotypical qualities.”95 A specific example of this stereotype in modern mainstream comics is the unrealistic representation of the female figure. For example, Catwoman was put into an absurdly small costume that emphasized an impossible body. These depictions of women in comics were also a product of the gender hierarchy present in American society.96 As we saw earlier, Scott argues that visual representations of women nearly always engage in one way or another cultural “scripts” of sexual roles and expectations.97 This male-dominated hierarchy and the objectification of women presented by Scott, emphasizes a gender hierarchy that is also evident in both society and the art world. Therefore, women in comics are under the control of the male dominated industry, which means their images were also controlled to their own fantasies.

The aspects of religion are often themes and ideas that are expressed through comic books and graphic novels. According to Darby Orcutt, author of an essay on “Comics and Religion: Theoretical Connections,” “some form of comics expression

94 Duncan and Smith, 248.
95 Duncan and Smith, 256.
96 Duncan and Smith, 256-257.
97 Scott, 1058.
exists within the broad context of nearly every major contemporary religious tradition.” 98 Therefore, comics appeal to all religions and are able to convey their specific religious morality through this medium. In addition, comics are valued for their accessibility to younger audiences and their ability to express moral guidance to.

Terry Ray Clark’s examination of prophetic and religious voice in graphic novels suggests “that the graphic novels Kingdom Come and Watchman represent and advocate a different kind of prophetic response to modern culture” than one usually expects in such instances. 100 These responses play with the idea of the apocalypse and explore different perception of religious authority, which is not the traditional source of authority within organized religions. The intent of these graphic novels is to present the reader “a new consciousness of individual and communal responsibility for transforming and saving the world.” 101 According to Clark, the “authors assume the authority to speak on matters of supreme importance for their societies […] because they consider themselves in possession of the charismatic gifts and insight necessary to produce an observant audience.” 102 In doing so, their graphic novels “represent narratives that uniquely address existential questions about time, authority, and evil.” 103 These authors address these questions by motivating their readers to act through their narratives and characters. This is the case on several comics that engage Joan of Arc as a character.

Joan of Arc in Modern Day Comics

98 Orcutt, 93.
99 Orcutt, 93-94.
100 Terry Ray Clark, "Prophetic Voices in Graphic Novels: The 'Comic and Tragic Vision' of Apocalyptic Rhetoric in Kingdom Come and Watchman," in Elaine Mary Wainwright and Philip Culbertson, eds., The Bible In/and Popular Culture: A Creative Encounter. (Atlanta, GA, Society of Biblical Literature, 2010), 141.
101 Clark, 142.
102 Clark, 155.
103 Ibid.
Many comics have taken on the character of Joan of Arc for various purposes. One is satire, casting Joan as a grumpy housewife beating English soldiers with a rolling pin who then trap her with a white sale, thus playing further on modern-day gender stereotypes.104

Sexual overtones also exist in other interpretations. Paul Gillon’s retelling of the life of Joan is an erotic story that suggests she almost consummates a relationship with one of her fellow knights.105 Because of its erotic content this comic upset defenders of the maiden storyline. The current curator of the Joan of Arc Center in Orléans mentioned that, despite opposition by the staff, his predecessor ordered the center's copy destroyed: it upset the notion of a “clean” memory that emphasized a virginal Joan with no sexual desire.106 Feminists were not impressed either, because Gillon simply traded one trope for that of sexual object, thus echoing feminist scholars Katherin McKinnon and Joan Scott's arguments.107 Interestingly, however, Gillon's work offended conservatives, too: they felt that to suggest anything other than the traditional story of purity rescuing the French nation amounted to insulting the land itself.108 Conservatives would face more comics surprises two decades later.

*Moi, Jeanne d’Arc*, written by Valérie Mangin and drawn by Jeanne Pushol, is a French graphic novel that reimagines the story of Joan of Arc (21.) This interpretation offers an extreme twist on her sexuality and religious beliefs, and drastically differs from

---

107 Scott, 1058.
108 Meeting at JCA, Orléans, January 13, 2015. Discussion with Olivier Bouzy, Director of the Center.
her associations with the French right, especially the extreme right-wing "national Front" party. According to Mangin’s introduction,

The historical person has disappeared behind the patriotic figure” cast by the National Front.109 This portrayal of Joan seems to “imply forgetting that Joan was long a symbol of the left: that of the people’s girl abandoned by the king of France and martyred by the Church.110

Mangin decided to take Joan’s image from the French right and reimagine her as lesbian witch. Such an interpretation allows the authors to play on stereotypes and hand the imagined character more power, something denied in more conservative depictions of her. The story, first intended as a diptych for publication by the comics publisher Dupuis, was cancelled after the first volume appeared, apparently because it had offended Catholic groups.111 A small French publisher then picked it up, and it was generally well received; the most negative comments suggested that some readers might be "perplexed" when contrasting their textbook memories of the maiden with what they would read in this comic.112

In order to consider this graphic novel in a scholarly context approaches such as mythic analysis and feminist interpretation help clarify the values it seeks to emphasize. The comic takes the Catholic traditions and myths surrounding Joan of Arc’s life and reacts against them by depicting a strong female society that rejects Christianity during Joan’s time. Through this approach, the graphic novel also gives power back to Joan and other women who disappeared from the historical scene when her image was adopted by

110 Ibid.
the right. In this fictional interpretation Joan is part of a cult-like group of powerful witches with their own religious power who separate from the patriarchal Catholic Church. Her association with witchcraft is also reminiscent of women condemned by the Church in the Middle Ages because they failed to conform to established social roles.

The female power illustrated here is her diffidence against the Church. This power is that of “a woman free and emancipated who chooses her destiny, even at the price of death.” Therefore, the author chose to illustrate Joan as having a great amount of control in contrast to the Church’s icon. This female-centered religion challenges the Church’s claim on Joan, as well. Mangin has Joan get her religious power from pagan gods, she even at one point has a son that is part beast. This contrasts with the Catholic tradition that Joan was a devoted Christian who heard messengers from God and was sent to deliver France.

The French graphic novel *Jeanne la Pucelle*, written by Fabrice Hadjadj and illustrated by Jean-François Cellier, depicts Joan with a very conservative Catholic bias: she is a more dutiful girl who has visions of angels. Joan is shown as a perfect symbol of a French girl, which is similar to the images of Joan in Vichy propaganda. She abides the stereotypical feminine values and is portrayed wearing a typical peasant dress with her hair kept long. Joan is also portrayed as a motherly figure through her actions. The emphasis of this graphic novel is Joan’s religious beliefs, likely in tune with the writer's own views: philosopher Fabrice Hadjaj, of Jewish descent, is a convert to

---

113 Mangin, 3.
114 Mangin, 62.
115 Jean-François Cellier and Fabrice Hadjaj, *Jeanne la Pucelle*, 2 volumes (Toulon, Soleil, 2012, 2014.)
Catholicism and writes religious texts and self-help books. Her visions are of biblical figures and angels, which keep her figure under the Church’s control and the French right. Were one to remain in the French cultural realm, Joan would this become either the subject of pastiche, or female sexual rebellion, or of conservative affirmation, all of which are still tied to her basic story. However, Joan's image is no longer limited to French-language comics, as evidenced by her appearance in Japanese Manga and in the American graphic novel Saints.

Joan’s image has appeared in Japanese manga. In some like Jeanne, written by Yoshikazu Yasuhiko, Joan’s image as a Christian figure is emphasized. The panels that depict Joan’s execution mirror the images shared in the postcards of the early twentieth century where Joan embraces the cross. There is also a stress on Joan’s depiction being particularly androgynous in some manga. This specific manga has a scene where Joan appears to be subjected to rape or some sort of sexual assault. Her assault could be interpreted in being a way for society to put her androgyny into perspective especially in a medium that tends to over sexualize its characters. Scott’s theory of man sexualizing women in society is present in Jeanne because even though she is not explicitly dressed in a provocative way, society cannot accept her asexuality and her androgynous appearance.

In the Manga tradition, stylized depictions are the norm, even though each artist adopts a certain style. However, there are dominant approaches in depicting sex and gender. Manga need to suit a male and female readership in a Japanese context first.

---


Since Japanese heterosexuality is strongly divided between the sex trade and the family, the element of fantasy matters more clearly in manga: they are the site of gender play. Consequently, youth can often appear as androgynous beings, and drawn scenes of rape that would shock a Western readership will become stylized rituals based on earlier Japanese novel traditions; they may even be considered expressions of love rather than appropriation. Consequently, Manga artists often depict Joan as androgynous, which could be due to her piety and youthfulness. Her androgynous appearance could also be caused by an association with a foreign image, but this is not a convincing trope. Indeed, in Japanese culture, cross-dressing and androgyny have a long tradition in both the theater and print arts, so the appearance of a young Joan of uncertain sex does not have to shock in the Japanese context. It is another matter, however, when the image of the warrior is used in a Chinese context.

The graphic novel diptych *Boxers* and *Saints*, written by Gene Luen Yang, which addresses questions about authority and evil (plate 20.) National Book Award finalists, Luen’s two integrated graphic stories narrate the two different sides of the Boxer Rebellion; the protagonists in *Boxers* are the Chinese rebels against the foreign invaders, the protagonists of *Saints* are Chinese Christian converts. To both sides of the rebellion the other is seen as an enemy who is represented as evil and immoral. In addition, like apocalyptic literature *Saints*, the second part of the diptych, casts the main character, Vibiana, in contact a heavenly messenger; the spirit of Joan of Arc, who visits and advises her.

---
118 McLelland, 87.
120 <http://www.nationalbook.org/nba2013_ypl_luenyang.html#.VTZ83GYmBGQ> (accessed April 2015.)
Like Hadjaj, Yuang was inspired by his Catholic upbringing when he wrote the story, but the parallels between the authors ends here. Whereas Hadjaj in effect resurrects the old traditional tail of Joan of Arc, Yang transposes her and emphasizes a moral issue within his character. Joan's ghost, shown as a saintly figure, inspires Vibiana to fight morally. She comes to this young Chinese girl in order to guide her through her new life as a convert to Christianity. At the conclusion of Vibiana’s story, the young Chinese heroine dies at the hand of Bao one of the Chinese rebels, which illustrates a parallel between her and her personal guide: like Joan, Vibiana was a martyr for her religion and was killed at the hand of her own countrymen. In addition, both parties wanted to do what was best for their land. Yang depicts Joan as a golden armored figure who is a saint. The odd thing about this is that historically the Catholic Church would not have recognized Joan as a saint at the turn of the century, the setting for the Luen’s narrative (Joan was not recognized as a saint until 1920.) Therefore, this portrayal of Joan emphasizes memory rather than history to link her own martyrdom and that of Vibiana.

VII. CONCLUSION

This thesis sought to investigate the manipulation and consumption of Joan's image in three instances in the twentieth century. While more could have been explored regarding the image of Joan in relation to popular culture, the three visual expressions, postcards, propaganda, and comics all reflect an evolutionary process that deconstructed and reconstructed the image of the heroine to suit certain agendas in some cases, but also

consumerism and entertainment in others. As such, they offer material and cultural evidence of the historicization of a female figure, and its impact in memory.

Postcards filled a double need in the Belle Époque, that to communicate with acquaintances and loved one, and to express a preference from the sender for a particular picture. While one may not know the frame of mind of the sender, it is clear that the religiosity dimension did play a role, but not always. Joan's martyrdom is covered minimally. What mattered to consumers of these icons were her deeds in life, not in her death.

The fact that these postcards evolve with Joan’s beatification and then her rise into Sainthood illustrates a shift from her as a figure of the left starting in the French Revolution, into one that allegedly united left and right wings in France, and finally her as an explicit image of the right. This shift uses a re-construction of gender, where she is no longer a maiden, but a saint. Her virginal power has been affirmed, and she gains new value in popular memory.

Additionally, this shift to the right is what serves Vichy France's propaganda efforts. The reactionary political wing, formed of an odd mix of royalists, fascists and conservative Catholic clergy saw Marshall Pétain as the savior of France. His inauguration speech, essentially an announcement if impending dictatorship, was couched in religious imagery: Pétain gave himself for France. It would have been logical to see Joan of Arc's martyrdom stressed, but the texts and images do not emphasize that. Instead, Joan is dutiful, knows her place in society, and is no longer a leading heroine. She fits an image of submission, which matches France having been invaded and subdued
by Germans this time. In other words, the gender construction here emphasizes a traditional role for the maiden, true to her family, her duty, and her faith. Vichy accomplished to form an image of Joan that removed this symbol of its original meaning of resistance, to transform it into one of compliance. This exploitation would have dire consequences after the war, for while schoolchildren still learn of Joan; she has been replaced with Marianne, the female symbol of the Republic, and Joan only serves the interests of the far right. While the symbol is empty, it does not mean that at the level of memory or gender, it has disappeared.

Joan’s representation in comics shows her importance as both a symbol of France and symbol used internationally. In two recently printed French graphic novels, there has been a correlation between the image of Joan and her associations with the right winged politics in France. In *Jeanne la Pucelle* Joan is depicted as a very conservative Catholic figure. In this particular graphic novel she is a dutiful girl with divine visions of angels, which reflects the image constructed by Vichy France of Joan as the epitome of the dutiful matron of France. In contrast, the graphic novel *Moi, Jeanne d’Arc* takes these conservative traditions and myths surrounding Joan’s life and reacts against them. Depicting a strong female society during Joan’s time does this difference and giving women power through their own sense of communal religious power. Furthermore, Joan is used outside of French comics and used internationally through this medium. Since is an icon that most cultures can identify and acknowledge she can be easily associated with and used to draw parallels, which led to her martyrdom being used to draw parallels to the main character in *Saints*. 
From a symbol in her lifetime and right after her death, Joan of Arc has continued to live in memory as a special symbol. She was turned into images of a heroine, saint, servant, or comic fantasy among others, which were not restrained to particularly French in focus. All point to a central element, however: her image has become devoid of religiosity even though she was anointed a saint less than a century ago. That is perhaps the central message of the visual culture of the twentieth century: a capacity to divorce the religious from the historical, all the while strengthening the gender image of the heroine, either as a sexually attractive symbol or a fierce female warrior. The dreams of Joan on paper are clearly unlimited. The politics that surround Joan and her image’s implications are present in this thesis. She still is being used today as a medium in order for a corrupt system to manipulate the way she is being viewed in order to achieve their personal fulfillment.
VIII. Bibliography

A. Archival Sources

APC (anonymous postcard collection, Villy-le-Bouveret, France)

Album of Joan of Arc postcards on loan to Prof. de Syon

BMD Bibliothèque de recherche sur le féminisme Marguerite Durand, Paris, France

DOS JDA Biographical file on Joan of Arc

Special collections

CJA Centre historique Jeanne d'Arc, Orléans, France

Comic Books

Postcards

Vichy era literature

IHTP Institut d'Histoire du temps présent archive, Paris, France

World War II archival files pertaining to Vichy France and to the French resistance.

ARC 074-12
ARC 074-17
ARC 074-57
ARC 074-58
ARC 074-59
ARC 074-69
ARC 074-70
ARC 074-71

B. Printed Sources


<http://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/bpt6k3735914> (accessed January 2015.)


IX: Appendix I

Exkurs: A Brief History of Comics

The creator of this sequential art form is thought to be Rodolphe Töpffer, who was a teaching-director of a preparatory school in nineteenth-century Geneva, Switzerland. He was a renowned translation scholar, specifically for the works of *Demosthenes* and the *Iliad*, but “is best known for what began as ‘doodlings’ done to give artistic yearnings an outlet and to delight his students.”122 These drawings done by Töpffer were a major influence in the development of the genre of comics. According to Duncan and Smith, these stories “made ‘a decisive break with older formats and […] initiated a new form of expression.’”123 One of the innovation Töpffer’s picture-stories had on sequential art was its ability to tell an overall amusing fictional narrative. Additionally, these innovations included those of form used in this medium to portray a particular narrative. Töpffer invented a form of shorthand in his drawings that became a standard in comic illustrations. It is this innovation that “allowed Töpffer’s panel compositions and panel sequences to be much more dynamic than any work that had preceded him.”124 Töpffer is considered to have created the art form of comics and his contributions to the medium were pivotal for its initial development.125

Other early influences in the development in comic books were comic strips and pulp fiction of the early twentieth century. The commercial aspect of the development of the comic book industry comes from the way that comic strips were reproduced in

---

122 Duncan and Smith, 24-25.
123 Duncan and Smith, 25.
124 Ibid.
125 Duncan and Smith, 26.
volumes. An example of this was the experimentation of the marketing of comic strips done in the 1920s by the Embee Distributing Company. This company developed *Comic Monthly*, which was made out of soft paper, cheaper interior paper, and a new sizing format. These alterations of the layout influenced the modern comic and became “a few steps closer to the product that would launch the comic book industry.”

Additionally, the talent, heroic archetypes, and themes used in comic books were generated from pulp magazines and their writers. Pulp magazines contained “powerful storytelling that helped establish most genres of popular fiction and launched the careers of many of America’s best-known writers, from Ray Bradbury to Raymond Chandler.” This influence carried over to the production of comic books. Many pioneers of the comic book were pulp publishers that began to publish for comics after a drop in sale their magazines. After this transition of publishers their pulp writers also became involved in comics, which explains the influence of pulp themes and heroic archetypes in the first comic books. Pulp magazines introduced characters that would later influence the superheroes of the 1930s and 1940s. This inspiration on comic books is present in the pulp heroes “costumes, secret identities, and abilities beyond those of ordinary mortals.”

The first comic books to be published in America were *The Funnies*, which were published by Eastern Color Printing Company. *The Funnies* are significant in the development of comic books because it contained original material, no reprints, and was printed weekly. The popularity of *The Funnies* and *Famous Funnies* illustrate the

---

126 Duncan and Smith, 27.
127 Ibid.
128 Duncan and Smith, 28.
129 Ibid.
commercial validity of this product, which influenced the emergence of this new medium.

According to Duncan and Smith, there are many eras of the development of comic books through the 1930s to the 1980s. The era of proliferation of American comic books was during the 1930s and was established by the popularity of *Action Comics* and the superhero.\textsuperscript{130} The *Action Comics* main superhero, Superman, ensure this new popularity and “the financial success of the new industry.”\textsuperscript{131} This cemented the association between comics, superheroes, and their adolescence audience. In the 1950s, the comic industry went through a rough time with low sales. This was due to the rise of television and the anti-comic book backlash that occurred.\textsuperscript{132}

At the start of the 1960s comics began to become more independent, which led the maturation of the genre. These new underground comics became “convention-defying, politically charged, and independently produced.”\textsuperscript{133} This new form of comics also led to a new form called the graphic novel. In the 1970s, graphic novels began to gain prominence in the comic world and were aimed an older audience. The popularity of Eisner’s graphic novel illustrated the significance of this new format of comics. *The Contract with God* also “established graphic novel as the term for a longer comics work with literary intent.”\textsuperscript{134} This maturation of the genre and its popularity led to the analysis of comics in a more scholarly context. Thus, graphic novels became a medium-worth series literarily worthy of attention.

\textsuperscript{130} Duncan and Smith, 31.
\textsuperscript{131} Duncan and Smith, 32.
\textsuperscript{132} Duncan and Smith, 40.
\textsuperscript{133} Duncan and Smith, 52.
\textsuperscript{134} Duncan and Smith, 70.
Furthermore, Duncan and Smith stress the idea of encoded messages within comics that are used to portray the narrative. The elements of comics, such as panels, composition, and text all create a means for interpretation of these messages. According to Duncan and Smith, “certain moments of prime action from the narrative are selected by the writer or artist and encapsulated in a discrete space, which in comics is called a panel.” The size of the panel, in comics, can affect the emphasis on the specific moment and time in that space. The time affected can either be the reading time or the time taken in the narrative of the comic book. Therefore, deciding on the particular “sequence of moments to encapsulate is important, because adjacent panels can interact to create a level of meaning that does not exist in individual panels alone.” The decision of the number of panels also affects the message of a comic. The panels of a comic are viewed as a unit that determine the cohesiveness of the narrative it is and influence the success of the piece overall. For all this complexity, why should one pay such attention to comics?

Duncan and Smith give three specific reasons why this medium deserves attention and analysis. These reasons include: originality as an art form, the new literacy comics present, and their historical significance. Comic books engage readers in different ways than other mediums such as movies, plays, or novels. According to Duncan and Smith, “the art of the pictorial narrative is, in fact, the original art form.” Therefore, other art forms stem from the pictorial narrative that is present within comics. Painting, sculpture, and other visual evolved out of this history. Paleolithic cave paintings contain sequenced images that show elements that later develop into the modern comic book characteristics.

135 Duncan and Smith, 10.
136 Ibid.
137 Duncan and Smith, 14.
Another justification to study comics is that they have components that can be viewed as another language. It is the emergence of sophisticated comics starting in the 1980s that began the focus of analysis on comics. According to Roger Sabin, it is the development of more mature titles that prompted literate analysis of “the mechanics of how the medium works.”138 This development of the sophisticated methodology for analysis of comics illustrates that comics are their own language. This language combines “writing and art which has its own syntax, grammar and conventions, and which can communicate ideas in a totally unique fashion.”139 According to Duncan and Smith, “[t]hey are not some hybrid from halfway between ‘literature’ and ‘art’ […] but an art of their own.”140 Therefore, comics are an original form of literature that deserves focus on their intricacies and complexities.

The new form of literacy that comes with comics is in the form of visual literacy. Since the development of comics the idea of literacy has been expanded. According to Duncan and Smith, “Visual literacy, the ability to understand pictorial information, became one of the basic skills required for communication in the latter half of the twentieth century.”141 Comics obscure the line between the importance of words and their relationship with pictures. Also, Duncan and Smith discuss the fact that “comic books [require] a different type of literacy because on the comic book page the drawn word and the drawn picture are both images to be read as a single integrate text.”142 Furthermore,

139 Ibid.
140 Duncan and Smith, 14.
141 Ibid.
142 Ibid.
comics represent a new transitional medium, which integrate these aspects in an intertextual way.143

The historical significance of the development of comics and their place in American culture is part of the reason they should be analyzed and studied. Before the invention of the television, comics were a large source for entertainment in America. They were read by a wide variety of people including children and adults.144 This medium in particular was considered “the dominant element in the culture of American children.”145 This popularity illustrates the cultural importance of comics in America during the twentieth century and also shows the influence comics can have on a society and the validity of study of this particular genre.

Comics as a medium have been used as a form of propaganda by governments since the Second World War. According to Duncan and Smith, “Propaganda tries to reach a large audience through the use of mass media and attempts to create a uniformity of interpretation among audience members by using what are arguably manipulative techniques.”146 Therefore, comics are an easy way to advance an ideology to a large audience. Additionally, comics are perceived as a juvenile form of entertainment, which allows these ideologies to go without notice. Since comics are viewed as “something funny, light, kid-friendly” readers are not aware they are reading a form of propaganda.147 A few comics that illustrate propaganda include superhero and war comics.

Furthermore, comics illustrate a similar association with propaganda that is similar to the postcards previously discussed. Postcards, like comics, are a medium that

---

143 Duncan and Smith, 14-15
144 Duncan and Smith, 15.
145 Ibid.
146 Duncan and Smith, 248.
147 Duncan and Smith, 249.
can be used by governments and other social institutions to create propaganda. These postcards were also a cheap form of mass media that were easily accessible to a large amount of the population. Since the postcards of Joan of Arc were a form of propaganda there was an underlying element of them that had the potential to manipulate the population into associating Joan with the right.

The superhero comics during World War II “fed off of the American government’s programme of domestic propaganda.”\textsuperscript{148} In addition, comics were an important “part of the Allied propaganda machine, emphasizing the need for a maximum war effort by portraying the enemy as the inhuman offspring of a vast and pernicious evil.”\textsuperscript{149} Comics dehumanized both the Nazis [and Japanese enemies of the US. According to Duncan and Smith, the German officers were depicted as being “arrogant, often barbaric, and they all delighted in cruelty.”\textsuperscript{150} Additionally, the Japanese were presented as having buckteeth, claw-like fingers, and greenish-yellow skin. These depictions had them appear more animal than human, a representation that went along with the wartime ideology of the American government. In contrast, American superheroes were often shown as patriotic heroes who often “[embodied] the spirit of America.”\textsuperscript{151} These images help formulate the government’s indoctrination of the population through popular culture. The use of stereotypes in forms of mass media resonates with the way images of Joan were used in propaganda used against the British forces during World War II. Cartoon images were used as propaganda against England, which fed off of stereotypes of the British. To further these perceptions, the Vichy regime

\textsuperscript{148} Duncan and Smith, 249.
\textsuperscript{149} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{150} Duncan and Smith, 250.
\textsuperscript{151} Ibid.
also used war heroes, like Joan, in their propaganda to further the government’s political agenda.

It is after World War II that several new genres appeared and coalesced into the three categories mentioned earlier, but the present state of comic arts, though based on developments of a second and third wave of comic innovation in the 1980s and 1990s is now at a cross-roads with the advent of the internet. The "ninth art," as it is called in France, has matured, but faces new opportunities and challenges in the electronic world.
X: Appendix II: Illustrations

Copyright matters: All reprinted materials have been authorized for publishing as part of this honors thesis. They may not be reproduced online even for non-commercial, academic purposes, without additional permission, from each copyright-holder or claimant to the original material from which the pictures were made involved.

Plate 1: Feast of Joan of Arc, interior of a church. Source: APC, used by permission.
Plate 2: Apothéose de Jeanne d'Arc. Source: APC, used by permission.
Plate 3: Apotheosis. Source: APC, used by permission.
Plates 4 and 5: Part of a series depicting her life the the model representing Joan of Arc transforms from a young girl bidding farewell to her father into a knight facing her judges. Source: APC, used by permission.
Plate 6: Joan is burned at the stake. The rope emphasizes her female shape. Source: APC, used by permission.
Plate 7: Joan bobs her hair (to suit the 1920s). Source: APC, used by permission.
Plate 9: A picture of the Pantheon fresco as Joan kisses the cross. Several versions of this postcard exist, some in black-and-white. Source: APC, used by permission.
Plate 10: Joan as Judith. Source: APC, used by permission.
Plate 11: Joan hears voices. Source: APC, used by permission.
Plate 12: One of a series of cards that portrays the stages of Joans life. Here, she hears voices. For good measure, the holy voice is surrounded by gold paint lines. Source: APC, used by permission.
Plate 13: As a maiden or a saint, Joan was pressed into service as a symbol of strength in World War I and after as a marketing tool. This postcard was given out in the 1920s at a Parisian children's shoestore for every purchase. Source: APC, used by permission.
Plate 14: Joan takes Orléans, raising her flag but not her sword. Source: APC, used by permission.
Plate 15: A German representation of Joan of Arc. Source: APC, used by permission.
Plate 16: An Italian vision of Joan of Arc. Source: Source: APC, used by permission.

Plate 18: Joan as a pious knight on the cover of a Vichy era booklet

IHTP archives, Paris, ARC 074-17, used by permission.
Plate 19 a and 19b (front and back) 13 mai 1944, la France entière fête Jeanne d’Arc héroïne nationale. Pour que la France vive il faut comme Jeanne d’Arc bouter les Anglais hors d’Europe », Source: IHTP, ARC 074-12. Used by permission.
Plate 20: The cover of Gene Luen Yang's *Saints*, released in 2013 as part of a diptych.

*art © Gene Luen Yang, used by permission of First Second Books.*
Plate 21: The cover of the Valérie Mangin and Jeanne Puchol's diptych, reissued in 2012 as a single volume after it was censored by the original publisher.

Art © Valérie Mangin and Jeanne Puchol, used by permission of Des ronds dans l'O publishing.